

Asian Americans: The Overrepresented Minority?

Dispelling the “Model Minority” Myth

Corinna J. Yu, MD, FASA

Imagine the following real-life scenarios:

Scenario 1: “**You smell like soy sauce!**” my kidney transplant patient exclaimed. Several hours later, he insisted, “**No, really, you smell like soy sauce! I want to eat your coat off!**” I had eaten a meatball submarine sandwich with marinara sauce and provolone earlier.

Scenario 2: Another patient inquired before her colonoscopy, “**Are you related to Dr. Kim?**” I responded, “No, Dr. Kim is Korean American. I am Taiwanese American.” “**Isn’t that the same thing?**” she pressed. “**Well, your English is really good,**” she complimented, despite my attempt to explain that I was born in Minnesota. *Uff da!*

Scenario 3: After discovering my husband was Chinese American, a well-intentioned coworker and friend told me, “**It’s good you married your own kind.**”

Scenario 4: “**You people brought the virus. Go back to China.**”¹ The recent labeling of the SARS-CoV-2 virus as the “Chinese virus”² has fueled outrage and acts of physical violence toward Asian Americans during the COVID-19 pandemic.³ Ironically, findings from a study showed that most New York coronavirus cases came from Europe.⁴

The scenarios above illustrate the need to address conscious and unconscious biases toward Asian Americans as one homogenous group of foreigners. One of the biases that continues to plague Asian Americans today is the concept of the “model minority.” It was first described in a 1966 New York Times article highlighting the relative success in assimilation of Japanese American immigrants.⁵ This model minority myth perpetuates today with “generalizations based on surface-level analysis at the expense of more-refined and nuanced investigation.”⁶ My investigation reveals that in medicine, we focus on *underrepresented* minorities, which excludes Asian Americans as a group because we have become the *overrepresented* minority. However, we need to understand three systemic issues that continue to impact Asian Americans. First, Asian Americans are overrepresented in medicine in part because of immigration laws enacted in the past century. Second, Asian Americans are overrepresented due to generalized categorizations that lead us to overlook differences between ethnic groups and omit underrepresented Asian Americans. Third, Asian Americans are underrepresented in leadership positions which affects their voice, visibility, and acceptance into American culture and organizations.

Asian Americans are overrepresented in the medical field because of immigration laws.

The Immigration Act of 1924 created national origins quota designed to “preserve the ideal of U.S. [northwestern European] homogeneity” that completely excluded immigrants from Asia.⁷ More than four decades later, the 1965 Immigration Act preferentially allowed immigration of

This is the author's manuscript of the article published in final edited form as:

Asian doctors and engineers, leading to overrepresentation of Asian Americans within these professions.⁸

Here are some recent statistics:

- 15% of doctoral degrees in the US are awarded to Asians.^{9,a}
- 21% of medical school applicants are Asian.¹⁰
- 19% of full time US medical school faculty are Asian.¹¹
- 17% of all active physicians identify as Asian.¹²
- 15-19% of anesthesiologists are Asian.^{13,14,b,15,c}

Despite comprising 5.6-6.8% of the US population,^{16,17,d} Asian Americans have a two to fourfold higher representation in medicine, including anesthesiology. This overrepresentation contributes to the model minority myth that Asian Americans have succeeded in American society.

Asian Americans are the overrepresented minority because of generalized categorizations.

In the same way that categorizing people as “North Americans” would neglect to recognize differences among Mexico, Canada, and Latin American countries, categorizing “Asians” similarly fails. For example, medical school applicants who identify as Asian comprise three predominant ethnicities: Indian, Chinese, and Korean.¹⁸ Anesthesiologists who identify as Asian are predominantly Indian, Chinese, Filipino, Vietnamese, and Korean in ethnicity.¹⁵ Other Asian countries are underrepresented. Underrepresented minorities such as Thai, Hmong, or Burmese students are not even listed, and only 1.8% of Asian medical school applicants are Laotian, Cambodian, Indonesian, and Japanese.^{18,e} Generalized categories of race or country of origin ignores the importance of ethnicity. For example, the US Census 2020 does not include a category for Taiwanese ethnicity,¹⁹ despite the fact that Taiwanese medical school applicants made up 3.5% of Asian applicants in 2019.¹⁸

Aggregating all Asian countries into one category ignores the unique differences between various Asian countries and ethnicities, some of which have been highlighted during the current COVID-19 pandemic. For example, one would expect the democratic country of Taiwan to be hard hit due to its location eighty-one miles off the coast of China and the numerous flights between the countries.²⁰ However, Taiwan learned from the 2003 SARS outbreak and equipped their Central Epidemic Command Center to restrict travel, establish quarantine protocols, encourage body-temperature monitoring, and ration mask distribution early in the pandemic.^{20,21,22} Taiwanese innovators also introduced the aerosol intubation box,²³ which has gone through multiple iterations in the US as an additional protective barrier during tracheal intubation.²⁴ South Korea similarly learned from the 2015 MERS outbreak and was successful in flattening the COVID-19 curve with expansive testing, contact tracing, and enforced isolation.²⁵ Singapore, notable for its use of English as its primary language of instruction in schools,²⁶ was praised during the first wave for its social distancing measures.^{27,28} All this is to say that not all Asian countries are the same, and that categorizing Asian Americans into one category does not account for differences in ethnic origins, including the differing health systems and governance structures in each Asian country.

Census 2020 is currently underway; it uses race to allocate government resources and services. However, the US Census is only as useful as the categories it contains. Omission, aggregation, and extrapolation of Asian American health data, for example, can lead to problems with interpretation.²⁹ President Obama identified the problem with aggregation and acknowledged the need for data collection and analysis of Asian American subpopulations in a 2009 executive order.³⁰ Asian Americans do well economically, but analysis of nineteen Asian American subpopulations revealed eight groups, including Hmong Americans, that had poverty rates higher than the US average.³¹ A large number of Hmong immigrant refugees resettled in Minnesota after the Vietnam War.³² Growing up, I remember the challenge my teachers had communicating with my friends' Hmong parents, who could neither read or speak English, nor read their own written language, which was first developed in the 1950s.³³ Evaluation of subpopulations is critical for the fair distribution and direction of resources and services to underrepresented Asian Americans.

While racial and ethnic identity remain important in medicine for genomics research, we should evaluate if these categories are useful for characterizing and developing our physician workforce in the current milieu of multiracial partnering. Projections for 2060 show that the fastest-growing group is the "Two or More Races" population at 226%, followed by Asians with a projected increase of 128%.³⁴ In the future it will be even more important to disaggregate data collection for analysis, and expand the scope of categories. Categories such as "first generation English native language," "first generation to college," or "income dollars per household member," may be more relevant in identifying subpopulations that need assistance with higher education, government resources, or political voice.

Asian Americans are underrepresented in leadership positions.

The current 116th US Congress has a record number of Asian Americans, but at 3.7%, is still underrepresenting the Asian population.³⁵ Some have described Asian Americans as the "invisible minority"³⁶ while others state that Asian Americans are the "least likely group in the US to be promoted to management."³⁷ Stereotypes and cultural differences contribute to this discrepancy.³⁸ These cultural barriers and biases contribute to the glass ceiling for Asian Americans in leadership and are referred to as the "bamboo ceiling."³⁹ The percent of Asian Americans in leadership positions such as anesthesiology department chairs, professional society leadership, and editorial boards is unknown. Prior research on the leadership in the American Society of Anesthesiologists examined underrepresented minorities in medicine and did not focus on Asian Americans.⁴⁰ If 19% of anesthesiologists are Asian American,¹⁵ we should expect approximately one in five anesthesiologist physician leaders to be Asian American; however, this is not my personal experience. In fact, some leadership workshops targeted toward minorities do not include Asian Americans because they are not an underrepresented minority. In one example, I had to look up the brochure's definition of "people of color," a phrase that has provoked debate, to see if I qualified to participate.⁴¹ Unfortunately, for this particular career development activity, "yellow" was not considered a color, and I was excluded from participation because I did not meet their definition of underrepresented minority.

The phrase “underrepresented minority” was initially used by the AAMC to refer to “Blacks, Mexican-Americans, Native Americans, and mainland Puerto Ricans.”⁴² Following the US Supreme Court’s decision in *Grutter v. Bollinger* in 2003,⁴³ the phrase was changed in 2004 to “underrepresented in medicine” to refer to “those racial and ethnic populations that are underrepresented in the medical profession relative to their numbers in the general population.”⁴² Since Asian Americans have a two to fourfold higher representation in medicine compared to their numbers in the general population, they are not technically underrepresented in medicine, despite being underrepresented in leadership. Yet true representation should reflect voice and power, and until Asian Americans are visible at the highest levels of leadership, there is work to be done to break down the bamboo ceiling.

Diversity and inclusion efforts should address Asian Americans.

Overrepresentation of Asian Americans in higher education⁴⁴ and in the medical profession feeds into the model minority myth and can perpetuate stereotypes that continue to obstruct Asian American leadership opportunities. We need to understand our conscious and unconscious biases toward Asian Americans, collect and analyze data using disaggregated categorizations of subpopulations to include underrepresented Asian Americans,⁴⁵ and work to promote Asian Americans into leadership positions.

How do we move forward? I have a few suggestions:

1. **Talk about race with grace.** For many, conversations on race and ethnicity are uncomfortable because there is ample opportunity to offend and it can be extremely personal. Yet avoiding the topic entirely fails to address the issue. Let’s start the conversation and extend grace to others as we share our personal viewpoints. We can agree to disagree.
2. **Perform root cause analysis on why race and ethnicity matters.** In the same way that future genotyping can help us create individual treatment plans, let’s expand our view of racial/ethnic makeup to understand the effect of culture and environment on individuals and their career potential. We can open the scope and evaluate categories such as immigration generation and language background to analyze how these factors play a role in our decisions and opportunities.⁴⁶ We need to collect more data, pinpoint the problems, and then find solutions.
3. **Examine our personal biases.** We all have biases, myself included. To address them we need to bring unconscious bias to the conscious mind (through conversations about race or findings from research) and focus on re-training our minds and cultivating the minds of generations to come.

In the same way that Crayola has expanded their eight original colors, we should expand our outlook until we can see the full spectrum of color in American society. How we see and understand people can and should eventually extend outside the boxes of race, ethnicity, and gender, especially in workforce evaluation. I can only hope that in the coming decades my Asian American⁴⁷ children will be seen as fully American and no one will be surprised at their English fluency. At the very least, I hope no one tells them that they smell like soy sauce.

References:

1. Loffman M. Asian Americans describe the 'gut punch' of racist attacks during coronavirus pandemic. PBS News Hour. <https://www.pbs.org/newshour/nation/asian-americans-describe-gut-punch-of-racist-attacks-during-coronavirus-pandemic>. Published April 7, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.
2. Little B. Trump's 'Chinese' Virus Is Part of Long History of Blaming Other Countries for Disease. *Time*. <https://time.com/5807376/virus-name-foreign-history>. Published March 20, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.
3. Campbell AF, Ellerbeck A. Federal Agencies Are Doing Little About the Rise in Anti-Asian Hate. The Center for Public Integrity. <https://publicintegrity.org/health/coronavirus-and-inequality/federal-agencies-are-doing-little-about-the-rise-in-anti-asian-hate>. Published April 16, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.
4. Gonzales-Reiche AS, Hernandez MM, Sullivan M, et al. Introductions and early spread of SARS-CoV-2 in the New York City area. medRxiv preprint. <https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.04.08.20056929>. Published April 16, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.
5. Petersen W. Success Story, Japanese-American Style. *New York Times*. January 9, 1966.
6. Harvard Law School Center on the Legal Profession. The Model Minority Myth. The Practice. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Law School Center on the Legal Profession; Volume 5, Issue 1, November/December 2018. <https://thepractice.law.harvard.edu/article/the-model-minority-myth/>. Published November/December 2018. Accessed May 1, 2020.
7. The Immigration Act of 1924 (The Johnson-Reed Act). Office of the Historian website. <https://history.state.gov/milestones/1921-1936/immigration-act>. Accessed May 1, 2020.
8. Liu JM. The Contours of Asian Professional, Technical and Kindred Work Immigration, 1965-1988. *Sociological Perspectives*. 1992; 35(4): 673-704.
9. Educational Attainment in the United States: 2019. United States Census Bureau. <https://www.census.gov/content/census/en/data/tables/2019/demo/educational-attainment/cps-detailed-tables.html>. Published March 30, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.
 - a. 681,000 doctoral degrees in Asian alone/4,557,000 doctoral degrees in all races=14.9%.
10. AAMC Diversity in Medicine: Facts and Figures 2019, Undergraduate Medical Education Data, Figure 2. Percentage of applicants to US medical schools by race/ethnicity (alone), academic year 2018-2019. <https://www.aamc.org/data-reports/workforce/interactive-data/figure-2-percentage-applicants-us-medical-schools-race/ethnicity-alone-academic-year-2018-2019>. Accessed May 1, 2020.
11. AAMC Diversity in Medicine: Facts and Figures 2019, US Medical School Faculty Data, Figure 15. Percentage of full time US medical school faculty by race/ethnicity, 2018. <https://www.aamc.org/data-reports/workforce/interactive-data/figure-15-percentage-full-time-us-medical-school-faculty-race/ethnicity-2018>. Accessed May 1, 2020.
12. AAMC Diversity in Medicine: Facts and Figures 2019, US Physician Workforce Data, Figure 18. Percentage of all active physicians by race/ethnicity, 2018. <https://www.aamc.org/data-reports/workforce/interactive-data/figure-18-percentage-all-active-physicians-race/ethnicity-2018>. Accessed May 1, 2020.

13. AAMC Diversity in Medicine, Facts and Figures 2019, US Physician Workforce Data, Tables 12. Practice Specialty, Females by Race/Ethnicity, 2018.
<https://www.aamc.org/data-reports/workforce/data/table-12-practice-specialty-females-race/ethnicity-2018>. Accessed May 1, 2020.
14. AAMC Diversity in Medicine, Facts and Figures 2019, US Physician Workforce Data, Table 13. Practice Specialty, Males by Race/Ethnicity, 2018.
<https://www.aamc.org/data-reports/workforce/data/table-13-practice-specialty-males-race/ethnicity-2018>. Accessed May 1, 2020.
 - b. Asian female and male anesthesiologists / sum of all anesthesiologists:
 $(2192+4363)/(10784+31153)=15.6\%$.
15. Peckham C. Medscape Anesthesiologist Lifestyle Report 2017, Race and Ethnicity, Bias and Burnout.
<https://www.medscape.com/features/slideshow/lifestyle/2017/anesthesiology#page=6>.
Published January 11, 2017. Accessed May 1, 2020.
 - c. Sum of Asian Indian, Chinese, Filipino, Vietnamese, Korean, Other Asian, and Japanese = $(7.3+5.3+2.4+1.2+1.2+1.1+0.8)=19.3\%$.
16. Hoeffel EM, Rastogi S, Kim MO, Shahid H. The Asian Population: 2010. The United States Census Bureau.
<https://www.census.gov/content/dam/Census/library/publications/2012/dec/c2010br-11.pdf>. Published March 2012. Accessed May 1, 2020.
17. United States Census Bureau. American Community Survey 1-Year Estimates, Public Use Microdata Sample, 2018.
<https://data.census.gov/mdat/#/search?ds=ACSPUMS1Y2018&cv=RACASN&wt=PWGTP>. Accessed May 1, 2020.
 - d. Race includes Asian/Total: $22,154,461 / 327,167,439=6.8\%$.
18. AAMC Diversity in Medicine, Facts and Figures 2019, Undergraduate Medical Education Data, Figure 3. Percentage of Asian (alone) applicants to U.S. medical schools by Asian subgroups, academic year 2018-2019. <https://www.aamc.org/data-reports/workforce/interactive-data/figure-3-percentage-asian-alone-applicants-us-medical-schools-asian-subgroups-academic-year-2018>. Accessed April 30, 2020.
 - e. Sum of Laotian, Cambodian, Indonesian, Japanese percentages = $0.1+0.3+0.3+1.1=1.8\%$
19. Taiwanese American Citizens League. Census 2020: "Write-in Taiwanese" Campaign.
<https://tacl.org/census-2020>. Accessed May 1, 2020.
20. Wang CJ, Ng CY, Brook RH. Response to COVID-19 in Taiwan: Big Data Analytics, New Technology, and Proactive Testing. *JAMA*. 2020;323(14):1341-1342.
doi:10.1001/jama.2020.3151
21. Tsai I. President of Taiwan: How My Country Prevented a Major Outbreak of Covid-19. *Time*. <https://time.com/collection/finding-hope-coronavirus-pandemic/5820596/taiwan-coronavirus-lessons>. Published April 16, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.
22. Griffiths, J. Taiwan's coronavirus response is among the best globally. *CNN World*.
<https://www.cnn.com/2020/04/04/asia/taiwan-coronavirus-response-who-intl-hnk/index.html>. Published April 5, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.

23. Everington K. Taiwanese doctor invents device to protect US doctors against coronavirus. *Taiwan News*. Published March 23, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.
24. Yu, CJ. Anesthesiologist Trials Taiwanese Intubating Box. YouTube. https://youtu.be/Hj0L_Dw5zU4. April 2, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.
25. Normile D. Coronavirus cases have dropped sharply in South Korea. What's the secret to its success? *Science*. <https://www.sciencemag.org/news/2020/03/coronavirus-cases-have-dropped-sharply-south-korea-whats-secret-its-success>. Published March 17, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.
26. Dixon LQ. The Bilingual Education Policy in Singapore: Implications for Second Language Acquisition. ISB4: Proceedings of the 4th International Symposium on Bilingualism. Somerville, MA: Cascadilla Press; 2005: 625-635. <http://www.lingref.com/isb/4/047ISB4.PDF>. Published May 2005. Accessed May 1, 2020.
27. Bociurkiw M. What the US can learn from Singapore's coronavirus strategy. *CNN Opinion*. <https://www.cnn.com/2020/03/13/opinions/coronavirus-what-the-us-can-learn-from-singapore-hk-bociurkiw/index.html>. Published March 13, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.
28. Zhang LM, Han GY. Social activities for seniors on hold for 14 days as precaution. *The Straits Times*. <https://www.straitstimes.com/singapore/health/social-activities-for-seniors-on-hold-for-14-days-as-precaution>. Published March 11, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.
29. Holland AT, Palaniappan LP. Problems With the Collection and Interpretation of Asian-American Health Data: Omission, Aggregation, and Extrapolation. *Ann Epidemiol*. 2012; 22(6):397-405. doi:10.1016/j.annepidem.2012.04.001
30. Office of the Press Secretary. Executive Order 13515 – Asian American and Pacific Islander Community: Increasing Participation of Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders in Federal Programs. <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/executive-order-asian-american-and-pacific-islander-community>. Published October 14, 2009. Accessed May 1, 2020.
31. Lopez G, Ruiz NG, Patten E. Key facts about Asian Americans, a diverse and growing population. Pew Research Center. <https://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2017/09/08/key-facts-about-asian-americans>. Published September 8, 2017. Accessed May 1, 2020.
32. Yang N. 10 things about Hmong culture, food and language you probably didn't know. Minnesota Public Radio News. <https://www.mprnews.org/story/2015/03/01/10-things-hmong>. Published March 1, 2015. Accessed May 1, 2020.
33. Ratliff M. Hmong-Mien languages. Encyclopaedia Britannica. <https://www.britannica.com/topic/Hmong-Mien-languages>. Published April 6, 2007. Accessed May 1, 2020.
34. Colby SL, Ortman JM. Projections of the Size and Composition of the U.S. Population: 2014 to 2060. US Census Bureau. <https://www.census.gov/content/dam/Census/library/publications/2015/demo/p25-1143.pdf>. Published March 2015. Accessed May 1, 2020.

35. Manning JE. Membership of the 116th Congress: A Profile. Congressional Research Service. <https://fas.org/sqp/crs/misc/R45583.pdf>. Published March 31, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.
 - f. 14 Representatives + 3 Delegates + 3 Senators= 20; 20/541= 3.69%
36. Kang EY. The Fight For Asian American Political Power. NPR. <https://www.npr.org/local/309/2019/05/30/728115121/the-fight-for-asian-american-political-power>. Published May 30, 2019. Accessed May 1, 2020.
37. Gee B, Peck D. Asian Americans Are the Least Likely Group in the U.S. to Be Promoted to Management. Harvard Business Review. <https://hbr.org/2018/05/asian-americans-are-the-least-likely-group-in-the-u-s-to-be-promoted-to-management>. Published May 31, 2018. Accessed May 1, 2020.
38. Johnson SK, Sy T. Why Aren't There More Asian Americans in Leadership Positions? *Harvard Business Review*. <https://hbr.org/2016/12/why-arent-there-more-asian-americans-in-leadership-positions>. Published December 19, 2016. Accessed May 1, 2020.
39. Hyun J. Breaking the Bamboo Ceiling: Career Strategies for Asians. New York, NY: Harper Collins Publishers; 2005.
40. Toledo P, Duce L, Adams J, Ross VH, Thompson KM, Wong CA. Diversity in the American Society of Anesthesiologists Leadership. *Anesthesia and Analgesia*. 2017; 124:1611-6.
41. Malesky K. The Journey From 'Colored' To 'Minorities' To 'People Of Color'. NPR. <https://www.npr.org/sections/codeswitch/2014/03/30/295931070/the-journey-from-colored-to-minorities-to-people-of-color>. Published March 30, 2014. Accessed May 1, 2020.
42. AAMC Underrepresented in Medicine Definition. <https://www.aamc.org/what-we-do/mission-areas/diversity-inclusion/underrepresented-in-medicine>. Accessed May 1, 2020.
43. O'Connor, SD & Supreme Court Of The United States. U.S. Reports: *Grutter v. Bollinger* et al, 539 US 306 (2003), 02-241.
44. *Students For Fair Admissions v. President and Fellows of Harvard College, Case 19-2005*. Amicus brief. <https://www.justice.gov/opa/press-release/file/1252046/download>. Published February 25, 2020. Accessed May 1, 2020.
45. Mukherji BR, Neuwirth LS, Limonic L. Making the Case for Real Diversity: Redefining Underrepresented Minority Students in Public Universities. SAGE Open. April-June 2017: 1-10. doi: 10.1177/2158244017707796.
46. Teranishi RT. Asians in the Ivory Tower: Dilemmas of Racial Inequality in American Higher Education. New York, NY: Teachers College Press; 2010: 148.
47. Randall. Farewell to the Controversial Hyphen in Asian American. AsAmNews. <https://asamnews.com/2019/04/01/farewell-to-the-controversial-hyphen-in-asian-american>. Published April 1, 2019. Accessed May 1, 2020.